

## Advocates Learning Community Call 2/7/19

### Sue Russell, T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood (T.E.A.C.H.)

- T.E.A.C.H. is a workforce intermediary to promote the early childhood workforce
  - Focusing on adequate compensation and education and the retention of the ECE workforce
- Both T.E.A.C.H. and Child Care WAGES are licensed in 22 states so far, 3 more expected
  - There are special programs in 11 states working on different components of access to credentialing and compensation such as two states focusing on barriers to higher education access
- The T.E.A.C.H. scholarship model takes a comprehensive approach. It is critical to factor in what we know about the data concerning the workforce and college completion. It is a racially, ethnically diverse group working part-time, and going back to school. The ECE workforce looks like these people. Many low-income women of color with children make up the T.E.A.C.H. program and ECE workforce, going *back* to college
- T.E.A.C.H. provides debt free college education for the ECE workforce
- Its large pool of participants helps leverage the higher ed system.
- Program is outcome focused and data driven:
  - Comprehensive Scholarship: books, tuition, stipends, paid release time
    - Working towards a CDA, Associates, Bachelors, Master's degree
    - Recipients must complete a certain number of hours, 9-15 for AA degrees
    - Bonus/Raise provided when participants complete credit hours,
    - counselor, coach, and mentor also supports participants balance work, family, scholarship and school responsibilities and navigate higher education
    - Participants commit to remain with their program for a year.
  - Last year, 87% of T.E.A.C.H. funding came from federal sources, mainly CCDBG
  - Some states have seen an increase in the quality or amount of dollars in CCDBG used for T.E.A.C.H.
  - Money is helping states add T.E.A.C.H. to their "menu"
  - 150,000 people received these scholarships since we started
  - Work in all kinds of settings: 52% work with infants and toddlers
  - 48 percent of TEACH participants are women of color
  - For 55 % TEACH recipients, TEACH enabled them to take the first step into college classrooms.
  - Typically take 14-17 credit hours, earn a 3.3-3.5 GPA, earnings increase by 8% a year, turnover rate nationally for TEACH participants is low, between 5 and 6%.

- If we require degrees, might we lose diversity? Not if you provide comprehensive support like TEACH
- 53% (Associates), 42% (Bachelors) graduates are women of color

### **T.E.A.C.H. in Wisconsin: Jeanette Paulson, Wisconsin Early Childhood Association**

- 20 years of TEACH in Wisconsin: 98% funded by CCDBG (the Quality and Infant Toddler set-aside)
  - We were a RTT state and after for those 5 years, we received additional funding.
  - TEACH in WI and nationally leveraged significant changes and improvements in our higher ed system and PD system.
  - Average about 1,000 scholarship recipients, up to 2,000 when there is funding
  - Priorities to support credit-based credentials (group, center, family child care--infant/toddler to school age teachers)
  - They are aimed at age levels, program position types, specialized care, inclusion, leadership and dual language.
    - AA scholarship recipients completed an average 18.9 credits per contract
    - BA scholarship recipients completed an average 24.9 credit hours
    - When we had more funding, we included master's degrees.
  - Don't have CDA, but 9 different credentials from 12-18 credits per credential
    - Average GPA for AA recipients was 3.55, BA 3.66
  - Now all 16 community and technical colleges in the state offer ECE Associates Degrees
  - Supported the work of faculty in creating a statewide curriculum with common course names, etc. so articulation could be improved from 2-4-year degrees and circulated for technical and community colleges as well as 4-year institutions
    - Supporting innovative ideas including an entire degree in Spanish
    - Support a statewide higher-ed steering committee inclusive of 2- and 4-year institutions of education as well as systems folks.
    - Supports the PD needs of ECE special ed teachers, directors, and providers
    - Created the first registry and the state supported significant movement in ECE through registry levels. When we implemented Young Start (our QRIS), we saw an increased demand for scholarships.
  - Waiting list for access to these scholarships, why we need more \$\$

- Fully supported, it costs about \$3 million a year for TEACH. We cannot support the demand. With new CCDBG funds, TEACH will be a major component of our state plan.

## **WAGE\$**

- WAGE\$ program provides graduated salary supplements, competition for better salaries, creates a well-trained, stable, fairly-compensated workforce, as well as counseling an administrative support.
- TEACH was started in 1990 in NC and WAGES in 1999 to keep teachers who have degrees. It is licensed like TEACH. It provides direct, graduated supplements and requires consistency within the same programs. This is how much it will be because you have this amount of education.
- Eligible if they work a minimum of 20 hours with children ages birth to five in a center or home, have a child care credential or some education beyond a high school diploma, work a minimum for 6 months in a licensed participating facility and earn wages under a wage/income cap. Participants also have a counselor.
- They must stay in their program for a certain amount of time.
- Below the AA level, educators are given two years to get to the next level, employer verifies and checks in
- There is a six-month commitment period and you must be continuously employed. Employer verifies that you are there and earn under the income cap.
  - Earn more if you have more education, logical increments for supplements, paid every 6 months
  - A WAGES counselor helps people get their degrees, determines their wages level, and verifies eligibility every 6 months and issues the supplement money.
- WAGE\$ has 5,399 participants, 99 % are women, 61% women of color origin Receive a \$902 average monthly supplement, 8% gain in earnings.
- \$10.5 million invested in 5 states.
- Increases stability and consistency for children.
- Increases an incentive for education as you are better compensated with more education.
- 74 % of participants nationally have at least an AA degree or higher or have submitted the paperwork to move up the ladder.

## **WAGE\$ in Florida: Phyllis Kalifeh, The Children's Forum**

- Florida has a higher minimum wage than the federal floor, but it is still low.
- Child Care WAGE\$ began in FL 2004, in Broward County and then Miami-Dade. Some believed that it should not interfere with the market. They overcame the initial resistance.
- 2016-2017 applied to be a part of a competitive initiative that included 8 states. We were tired of hearing that compensation was an intractable dilemma.

- Conducted a survey: folks who were not direct providers, might be serving on boards (had an income test) or related agencies in ECE. We wanted the attitudes of those outside our immediate circle. Most people believe that providers need to be paid more and educated more.
- Thought that ECE providers should earn about \$15 an hour. This might be influenced by the Fight for \$15.
- Used this to raise awareness. Local communities in Florida choose how to invest their CCDBG quality funds.
- WAGES is one strategy to move us closer to recognizing gaps and disparities in the workforce. It is not the answer. It moves ECE closer to parity with K-12 compensation
- Doing a QRIS using CLASS assessment scores to determine additional funding for teachers.
- The state paid for the assessment. Left it to locals who could invest in WAGES.
- A 2017 workforce survey found that people with both school and WAGES had higher CLASS scores
- Picking up additional counties-Pinellas and Hillsborough coming on board.
- We are working on a bill and support for higher appropriations for WAGES at the state level
- Reception has been positive so far, hope it passes this legislative session

### **School Readiness Tax Credits: Melanie Bronfin, Louisiana Policy Institute**

- In LA, you can be a child care teacher and not have a high school degree.
- School Readiness Tax Credits passed in 2007 when we were starting QRIS
- Purpose to be an incentive and support to improve quality
- Not a substitute for appropriations, but it is working in Louisiana
  - There are two credits that are related to wages.
  - Provider credits, director and teacher credits; director and teacher credits are most effective and have been very effective in raising quality.
  - Provider credits: based on star rating and the number of children they serve in the child assistance program, ranges from \$750-\$1500 per child from a 2-5-star rating.
  - Teacher and Director credit: based on education level, center based, must be in a center participating in the rating system but doesn't vary with star rating, they are the most powerful credits.
    - CDA, \$1715 a year (if stay at center at least 6 months)
    - AA, \$2286 a year
    - BA, \$2857 a year
    - MA, \$3429 a year
    - They put the consumer price index in the statute, so these amounts will increase.

- Provider credit is a disappointment as providers don't necessarily have to put the money back into the school. We have about 450 providers who received the credit. The average amount is about \$10,000 each.
- - Full scholarships for CDA's funded by CCDBG
- All these credits are refundable, like an earned income tax credit in this way
- The funding is uncapped. It is not an appropriation. It creates a constituency for them.
- The state has been cutting child care assistance. This impacts the centers where credits are based on number of child care assistance recipients. However, the credits have been effective in increasing the teachers going back to school.
- The number of teachers who received a CDA increased from 1240-5000 teachers from 2008-2015
- The number who got higher credentials also had an eight-fold increase.
  - Finally requiring a CDA in Louisiana for lead teachers in a publicly funded centers (phased in over a period), however there is still a high turnover for people with higher credentials because they then go to Pre-K programs and Head Start
  - Changed the teacher credit effective for 2018 so that if you have a CDA and stay in the center for a year, it raises you to the \$2857 level, and if you have a CDA and stay in the child care sector for two years you receive the \$3,429 a year . This provides an alternate route that hopefully will impact turnover.
  - In 2016, there were 4,000 directors and staff earning \$8.7 million total in tax credits. Now that all centers that accept CCAP are required to participate in the rating system and their lead teachers have to have a CDA effective June 2019, this should go up.
  - Created an additional route for directors-based on the rating of a center. If a center does well, a director can move up their level for the credit based on their work to make the center higher quality.
    - Aimed to reduce the turnover that comes with higher credentials and provide consistency in centers, for children, and job stability for teachers.

## Questions

- For Melanie: How much money is spent on scholarships per year?
  - Does not have an exact number, but the CCDBG increase had perfect timing as Louisiana required all lead teachers in centers that take CCAP to get their CDA. The CDA program must be certified by the state. This

created a lot of programs. They are tied directly to the CLASS and components of the rating system.

- For Melanie: If I have CDA in a center for 4 years, do I earn as much as a BA teacher who has also been at the center for 4 years?
  - Yes
    - Has the potential to disincentivize teachers with BA degrees from being in a child care center
- For Melanie: How much per individual teacher?
  - The average salary for a child care teacher in Louisiana is \$20,300.
  - The pay now in centers is so low that if you have a BA turnover is high and you really don't want to work in a center.
  - What about AA degrees?
  - Melanie: an AA degree teacher can easily go to Head Start or the school system.
  - Melanie: the teacher credit is easy to sell to a conservative state as it is efficient, no cost to administering it if use the current tax system to distribute revenue.