Setting Up Families for Success: Advancing an Advocacy Framework for Low-Wage Working Parents & Their Children

JULY 19, 2016
ABOUT THE CENTER

We’re passionate champions of policies and laws that help women and girls achieve their potential throughout their lives — at school, at work, at home, and in their communities. We’re committed advocates who take on the toughest challenges, especially for the most vulnerable women — and we make change happen. We're proud to have been on the frontlines of virtually every advance for women for more than 40 years, benefitting their families, their communities, and the nation.
Our Presenters

- Dr. Julia Henly, Associate Professor, School of Social Service Administration, University of Chicago
- Julie Vogtman, Senior Counsel & Director of Income Support Policy, National Women’s Law Center
- Karen Schulman, Child Care and Early Learning Research Director, National Women’s Law Center
- Jessica Bartholow, Policy Advocate, Western Center on Law & Poverty
- Amy Matsui, Senior Counsel & Director of Government Relations, National Women’s Law Center
Today’s Presentation

- The data: Worker schedules and child care access
- Scheduling policies that can make a difference
- Child care policies that can make a difference
- Finding a path for unity on the path toward family economic security
Poll Questions

I am a(n)...

• Advocate
• Policy maker
• Student
• Academic
Poll Questions

What are you hoping to get from this webinar?

• Data on parents in the low-wage workforce and their children
• Information about promising policies and practices on scheduling and child care
• Messaging that connects parents and children’s wellbeing to policy solutions
• Recommendations for organizations who want to build cross-cutting coalitions or advocacy campaigns
• All of the above!
THE DATA:
Worker Schedules &
Child Care Access
Outline

• Labor market trends, disproportionately affecting low-income families
  – Focus on work schedule instability

• How instability of labor market is passed onto workers and families

• With implications for:
  – Child care arrangements
  – Access to public benefits
The Employment Context

• Employment instability in the U.S. has increased over the past four decades.

• Less-educated, younger workers, and workers of color have been most affected, including low-income parents with young children.

• Problem is not just unemployment, but also underemployment (hour scarcity) and work schedule instability.

Unemployment Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean Weeks Unemployed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Weeks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>13.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>20.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>18.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>35.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>28.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Underemployment

Involuntary Part-time Employment
(CPS 1973-2016, in thousands)

2008-2010 Recession
Dimensions of Precarious Work Schedules

• **Nonstandard Timing** (e.g., Presser, 2003)
  – Work outside of 9-5, weekday hours (weekends, evenings, and overnight)

• **Unpredictability***
  – Limited advance notice of work schedule

• **Variability in hours***
  – Fluctuations in work hours by week, time of day, and length of shift

• **Limited Schedule Control***
  – Limited input into the number and timing of schedule

*See Henly, Shaefer, & Waxman, 2006; Lambert, 2008; Henly & Lambert, 2005*
### Scheduling items, NLSY – 97, Nationally representative sample of young adults (age 28-33 in 2011-12)

#### Advance Notice (Predictability)
- How far in advance do you usually know what days and hours you will need to work?
  - One week or less; Between 1 & 2 wks; Between 3 & 4 wks; 4 wks or more)

#### Hour Fluctuations
- In the last month, what is the greatest number of hours you've worked in a week at this job?
- In the last month, what is the fewest number of hours you've worked in a week at this job?
- How many hours do you work for [employer name] in a normal week?

#### Schedule Control
- Which of the following statements best describes how your working hours are decided?
  - Starting and finishing times are decided by my employer and I cannot change them on my own;
  - Starting and finishing times are decided by my employer but with my input;
  - I can decide the time I start and finish work, within certain limits;
  - I am entirely free to decide when I start and finish work;
  - When I start and finish work depends on things outside of my control and outside of my employer's control
## NLSY, Dimensions of Precarious Scheduling

### Vulnerable Groups of Hourly Workers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hour fluctuations</th>
<th>Short notice</th>
<th>No schedule input</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Max – Min Hours / Usual</td>
<td>One week or less in advance</td>
<td>Employer decides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fathers</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/Ethnicity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino/a</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low-Wage Jobs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>.30</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Lambert, Fugiel, & Henly, 2014)
## NLSY, Dimensions of Precarious Scheduling

### Select Occupations, Hourly Workers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hour fluctuations</th>
<th>Short notice</th>
<th>No schedule input</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Max – Min Hours / Usual</td>
<td>One week or less in advance</td>
<td>Employer decides</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and housekeepers</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food service</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>.50</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home care</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Lambert, Fugiel, & Henly, 2014)*
Instability in labor market is passed on to workers and their families

- Nonstandard and precarious work schedules associated with:
  - Employee stress
  - Work-family conflict
  - Interferences with non-work activities
  - Child well-being

Precarious work schedules constrain family child care options

- Formal child care centers and preschools provide mostly daytime, weekday, fulltime, regular schedule

- Licensed family child care homes more likely to offer part time and evening; still few weekend, night

- License-exempt (informal family, friend, & neighbor) provides most evening, weekend, variable hours care

(NSECE, 2014; 2015; Han, 2004; Presser, 2003; Henly & Lambert, 2005; Scott et al, 2005)
NSECE, Share of providers offering nonstandard hour care serving children 0 to 5 years, not yet in kindergarten

Child care settings that are licensed to provide nonstandard hour care in Cook County, Illinois

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Child Care Centers</th>
<th>Licensed Family Child Care Homes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Open Hours</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evenings</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(between 7pm-2am)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overnights</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(between 2am-5am)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekends</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable Schedules</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Programs licensed to provide after hour care do not necessarily do so. Programs offering variable hours may charge parents for hours when children are not using care.*

Precarious work schedules complicate access to child care assistance programs

• Employment instability ⇒ Program instability

• Child Care Subsidy Program
  - Employment is condition of eligibility
  - Subsidized child care hours are determined based on number of work hours

• IL/NY Child Care Research Partnership Study (Henly, et al, 2015) finds that:
  - Precarious work schedules and employment instability interfere with subsidy access, maintenance, and redetermination.
  - Job loss and unpredictable work schedules increase risk of prematurely leaving the subsidy program.
Scheduling Policies That Can Make a Difference
How to improve parents’ work schedules—and benefit their children

• Provide greater employee input into work schedules.
• Provide advance notice of work schedules.
• Discourage last-minute changes to scheduled shifts.
• Expand opportunities for part-time workers.
Local model: San Francisco Retail Workers’ Bill of Rights

• Applies to “formula retail” establishments (retail stores, fast food businesses, restaurants, hotels, and banks with 40+ similar stores nationwide, at least 20 employees in San Francisco)

• This city ordinance requires:
  - Two weeks’ advance notice of work schedules, with extra pay if changes are made to schedules with less than seven days’ notice.
  - Promotion of full-time work, by offering additional hours of work to existing part-time employees before hiring new employees.
  - Limits on the use of on-call shifts, including paying employees for some time when they are required to be available, but are not called in.
  - Parity between part-time and full-time employees with respect to rate of pay, ability to earn time off, and access to promotion opportunities.
Federal model: Schedules That Work Act

• **Right to request.** The bill would create a right for all employees to make scheduling requests without retaliation by employers.
  - Employers would be required to grant schedule requests made so that employees can meet caregiving responsibilities, work a second job, pursue education and training, or manage a serious health condition, unless they had a bona fide business reason not to do so.

• In restaurant, retail, and building cleaning jobs, the bill would require:
  - **Two weeks’ advance notice of work schedules.**
  - **Compensation for last-minute schedule changes.** Employees would receive one additional hour of pay for on-call shifts or schedule changes made with less than 24 hours’ notice.
  - **Reporting time pay.** Employees sent home from work early would be paid for at least four hours of work or the hours in the scheduled shift, whichever is less.
Private Sector Models

- **Guaranteed hours at Cooperative Home Care Associates (CHCA).** CHCA guarantees a 30-hour workweek to employees who agree to take the cases offered to them and agree to be on call every other weekend.

- **More stable and adequate hours at Costco.** Costco guarantees a minimum number of weekly hours for most employees (both full- and part-time). Managers have also provided work schedules two weeks in advance and minimized disruptive, last-minute changes to scheduled shifts.

- **Worker-driven improvements at Walmart.** Following persistent demands from OUR Walmart, a grassroots organization of Walmart workers, Walmart has promised that, by the end of 2016, it will provide all workers with their schedules at least 2.5 weeks in advance and make new “fixed shift” and “flex shift” options available.
• 61 percent of registered voters—and a full two-thirds of women registered voters—would favor a candidate who supports requiring employers to provide stable, predictable schedules for hourly employees. (American Women, December 2015)

• 72 percent of Americans support requiring chain stores and fast-food outlets to give workers at least two weeks’ notice of changes in their work schedules. (CBS News, June 2015)

• In a poll commissioned by the Council of State Chambers of Commerce, 78 percent of business executives surveyed support scheduling polices that limit employers’ ability to use on-call scheduling and require them to give employees sufficient advance notice of their work schedules. (LuntzGlobal, Dec. 2015)
Child Care Policies That Can Make a Difference
Expand investments in child care and early education

- Increase funding for the Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) to make child care assistance available to more low-income families and improve the quality of care.
- Provide tax assistance to help families meet the high costs of child care.
- Increase investments in high-quality early education programs, including federal Head Start and Early Head Start programs and state prekindergarten programs.
- Help workers access and afford child care through their employers.
Design child care and early education policies and programs to meet the needs of low-wage working families

- Provide 12-month eligibility for child care assistance and other early care and education programs, regardless of changes in income or job status.
- Take into account fluctuations in income in determining a family’s eligibility so that a temporary spike in income does not disqualify the family.
- Encourage coordination between prekindergarten programs and child care providers to meet the needs of parents with nontraditional work schedules.
- Support family, friend, and neighbor (FFN) care as an option for families who prefer it or lack other options.
Expand supports for child care providers

- Increase child care providers’ compensation and professional development opportunities and give them a greater voice in the policy-making process.

- Provide financial incentives and technical assistance to encourage child care centers and family child care providers to offer care during nontraditional hours.

- Invest in initiatives that support FFN providers through education and training, mentoring, networking opportunities, and help accessing other resources.
Jessica Bartholow, Western Center on Law & Poverty

Finding a Path for Unity on the Path Toward Family Economic Security

#WorkingFamilies
#TalkPoverty
@HollyJMitchell
@Jess_Bartholow
@Western_Center
@NWLC
Make employment a real option for every low-income American.

- Create jobs (i.e. infrastructure, green jobs, child care, elder care)
- Strengthen protections for women, pregnant, older, parenting workers & workers of color.

Prevent long-lasting harm to children & vulnerable adults by protecting (and treating w/ dignity) families who can’t work.

- Social Security and Supplemental Security Income
- Temporary Aid to Needy Families (TANF)
- Unemployment Insurance
- Nutrition Assistance Programs (SNAP, WIC, School Meals, Food Banks)

#WorkingFamilies #TalkPoverty @Jess_Barholow @Western_Center @NWLC @BlackWkrCenter @SEIU721 @EqualRightsAccess @CA4SSI @HungerActionCA @CAFoodBanks @PolicyLink @CaliforniaLabor @AFSCME @JobsWithJustice
Finding unity on the path toward family economic security

Strengthen worker rights and purchasing power, making an honest day’s work brings an honest day’s pay.

- Raise the Wage.
- Fair Scheduling.
- Wage Theft.
- Earned Income Tax Credit.
- Wage Garnishment.
- Collective Bargaining.

Establish the right of all workers to have paid sick days.

Create or improve Paid Family Leave so that workers can care for a new baby or an ill family member without losing a job or going broke.
Make excellent and affordable child care an option for every working parent and for children who need it.

- Increase funding for subsidized slots for families who work & children in those who cannot.
- Improvements to Eligibility Rules for workers with varying schedules.
- Increase rates of pay.
- Increase and fully fund training for workers.
- Child care workers need to be supported in various settings –there cannot be one size fits all.

Ensure that more workers have the right to fair and predictable schedules and to request accommodations in work schedules.

#WorkingFamilies  #TalkPoverty  @Jess_Bartholow  @Western_Center  @NWLC  @RaisingCA  @ParentVoicesCA  @YoungInvicibles  @UFCW  @UFCWWSC8  @HelpAMotherOut  @SIEU_California  @CLASP_DC  @PopDemoc
Finding unity on the path toward family economic security

Without Unity - We May Win the Policy But We Won’t Win the Fight.

• We can support work and still protect those who cannot work.
• We can pay child care workers better and still create slots.
• We can make paid leave policies more equitable and more robust.
• We can improve quality of workforce & support collective bargaining.
• We can increase worker protections while also increasing wages.

Highlighting inequities in gender and race may be discouraged – but it is necessary.

We need to re-educate ourselves about collective bargaining.

We need to set the tables now to have the hard conversations.
Questions?
More Resources For You

• The data – *Set Up to Fail: When Low-Wage Work Jeopardizes Parents’ and Children’s Success*

• The action agenda – *Set Up for Success: Supporting Parents in Low-Wage Jobs and Their Children*
More Resources For You

• The advocacy framework –

*Set Up for Success: Why Fair Schedules Are Critical for Working Parents and Their Children’s Well-Being*


*Set Up for Success: Why Early Care and Education Policies Must Address Low-Wage Working Parents’ Needs*


*All resources are available at [www.nwlc.org/lowwageparents](http://www.nwlc.org/lowwageparents).*
Contact Us

• Jessica Bartholow, Western Center on Law & Poverty (www.wclp.org): jbartholow@wclp.org

• Julia Henly, University of Chicago School of Social Service Administration: jhenly@uchicago.edu

• NWLC (www.nwlc.org)
  – Amy Matsui: amatsui@nwlc.org
  – Karen Schulman: kschulman@nwlc.org
  – Julie Vogtman: jvogtman@nwlc.org

  Join the conversation on twitter!
  #SchedulesThatWork #LowWageWork